

# **Between Absence and Presence**

The Antinomic Grammar of Theological Discourse about God as  
Trinity with Special Reference to  
**Jürgen Moltmann** and **Vladimir Lossky**

**Corneliu Boingeanu**

# **Between Absence and Presence**

The Antinomic Grammar of Theological Discourse about  
God as Trinity with Special Reference to  
**Jürgen Moltmann and Vladimir Lossky**



**EDITURA UNIVERSITARĂ**  
**București**

Coperta: Angelica Badea

---

Copyright © 2009  
Editura Universitară  
Director: Vasile Muscalu  
B-dul. N. Bălcescu nr. 27-33,  
Sector 1 , București  
Tel./Fax: 021 – 315.32.47 / 319.67.27  
www.editurauniversitara.ro  
e-mail: redactia@editurauniversitara.ro

---

EDITURĂ RECUNOSCUTĂ DE CONSILIUL NAȚIONAL AL CERCETĂRII  
ȘTIINȚIFICE DIN ÎNVĂȚĂMÂNTUL SUPERIOR (C.N.C.S.I.S.)

**Descrierea CIP a Bibliotecii Naționale a României**  
**BOINGEANU, CORNELIU**  
**Between absence and presence / Boingeanu**  
Corneliu. - București : Editura Universitară, 2009  
ISBN 978-973-749-538-9

2

© Toate drepturile asupra acestei lucrări sunt rezervate Editurii Universitare

---

Distribuție: tel/fax: (021) 315.32.47  
(021) 319.67.27  
comenzi@editurauniversitara.ro

---

ISBN 978-973-749-538-9

## OUTLINE

<b>Abstract</b> .....	9
<b>Acknowledgements</b> .....	10
<b>INTRODUCTION</b> .....	11
1. Prolegomena .....	11
2. The Debate .....	16
<b>PART I: THE ABSENT PRESENCE OF THE TRINITY IN THE ECONOMY</b> .....	25
<b>I. Eternity and Temporality in Divine Life: Absence and Presence in Human Life</b> .....	25
1. Temporality versus Eternity .....	27
2. Absence versus Presence .....	30
3. Oneness versus Threeness .....	34
4. Theology versus Praxis .....	38
5. Summary .....	42
<b>II. Expression and Absence Terminologies</b> .....	45
1. The grammar of deconstruction .....	45
2. The grammar of faith .....	48
3. The grammar of love .....	53
<b>III. Apophatic and Cataphatic Theologies</b> .....	57
1. The Apophatic Tradition and Language .....	59
1.1. Clement of Alexandria: apophaticism in embryo .....	60
1.2. The Cappadocian Fathers: apophaticism in balance .....	62
1.3. Pseudo-Dionysius the Areopagite: apophaticism in the extreme. ....	64
1.4. Summary .....	68
2. Apophaticism and Deconstruction .....	69
<b>IV. Self-identity, Silence and Presence of God as Trinity</b> .....	72
1. The Trinity's Self-Identity: Silence and its Echo in Ecclesiology .....	73
1.1. God's elusive presence in His Revelation .....	74
1.1.1. The elusive presence of God the Father .....	77
1.1.2. The Elusive Presence of God the Son .....	84
1.1.3. The Elusive Presence of God the Holy Spirit .....	89
1.1.4. Conclusion .....	93
1.2. The Trinity's Elusiveness in Theology. ....	95

2. The Trinity's Self-Identity: Presence and its Model for Ecclesiology .	103
2.1. Historical background of the ontology of relations .....	104
2.2. The ontology of relations and the Church .....	112
2.3. The Holy Trinity as an experiential Foundation .....	119
2.3.1. Social conflict between one and many .....	120
2.3.2. Divine synthesis between one and many .....	124

<b>V. Evaluation and Critique: The Quest for a Re-examination of the Trinitarian Description</b> .....	133
1. Epistemological debate .....	134
2. Ontological debate .....	136
3. Towards a re-examination of theological grammar .....	137

**PART II: JÜRGEN MOLTMANN: A CATAPHATIC  
EPISTEMOLOGY OF THE TRINITY** .....

<b>I. <i>Modus Operandi</i>: The Dialectical grammar of the Trinity</b> .....	142
1. Dialectic and Analogy .....	143
2. Dialectic and History .....	147
2.1. Dialectical history of resurrection .....	148
2.2. Dialectical history of time .....	151
2.3. Dialectical love of God's history with the world .....	156
3. Dialectic and the Christ Event .....	158
3.1. The paradox of the cross .....	160
3.1.1. Epistemological paradox .....	160
3.1.2. Ontological paradox .....	163
3.2. The paradox of resurrection .....	166
4. Conclusion .....	168

<b>II. <i>Modus Cognoscendi</i>: The Cataphatic Grammar of Creation</b> .....	171
1. God's Revelation and Creation .....	171
1.1. Participative knowledge of God .....	172
1.2. Eschatological Language of Revelation .....	173
1.3. Ontological proof of God .....	180
1.4. Kerygmatic hermeneutics of the Church .....	184
1.5. Messianic theology of Creation .....	186
2. Christology and Creation .....	190
2.1. Christology in historic shape .....	190
2.2. History in divine shape .....	193
3. Pneumatology and Creation .....	197

3.1. Cataphatic Pneumatology .....	198
3.2. Pragmatic Pneumatology .....	200
4. Trinity and Creation .....	204
4.1. Perichoretic ontology of the Trinity .....	208
4.1.1. Father-Son perichoresis .....	209
4.1.2. Father-Spirit perichoresis .....	212
4.1.3. Son-Spirit perichoresis .....	215
4.2. Inner-trinitarian epistemology of God the Creator .....	217
5. Conclusion .....	225
<b>PART III: VLADIMIR LOSSKY: AN APOPHATIC</b>	
<b>EPISTEMOLOGY OF THE TRINITY</b> .....	228
<b>I. <i>Modus Operandi</i>: Apodictic Methodology</b> .....	230
1. The Apodictic Antinomy of Christian Theology .....	231
2. The Apodictic Union with God .....	235
3. The Apodictic ‘Instant’ of Eternity in Time .....	240
4. Conclusion .....	244
<b>II. <i>Modus Cognoscendi</i>: Apophatic Epistemology</b> .....	245
1. Revelation: The Apophatic Grammar of the Trinity .....	246
1.1. Beatific vision. ....	248
1.1.1. Clement’s Epistemology according to Lossky .....	251
1.1.2. Origen’s Epistemology according to Lossky .....	255
1.1.3. The Cappadocians’ Epistemology according to Lossky ....	258
1.1.4. Dionysius’ Epistemology according to Lossky .....	265
1.1.5. Maximus’ Epistemology according to Lossky .....	269
1.1.6. Palamas’ Epistemology according to Lossky .....	272
1.2. The mystical knowledge of God .....	276
1.3. The enigmatic nature of the uncreated energies .....	282
1.4. Conclusion .....	286
2. Creation: The Lost Grammar of the Trinity .....	289
3. Christ: The Economy of the Word .....	294
4. Holy Spirit: The Economy of the Third Person .....	298
5. The Holy Trinity: The Divine Persons without Economy .....	304
6. Conclusion .....	309
<b>CONCLUSION: BETWEEN ABSENCE AND PRESENCE</b> .....	312
1. The strengths and limits of “presence” .....	312
2. The strengths and limits of “absence” .....	316
3. Towards the antinomic grammar of the Trinity .....	320

<b>List of Abbreviations .....</b>	<b>327</b>
<b>Bibliography I –Primary Texts .....</b>	<b>329</b>
<b>Bibliography II – General Works .....</b>	<b>334</b>
<b>Bibliography III – Works on Moltmann and by Moltmann .....</b>	<b>354</b>
<b>Bibliography IV – Works on Lossky and by Lossky .....</b>	<b>367</b>